



## Design Review Board

---

### *Minutes*

**November 8, 2016  
Council Chambers – Lower Level  
57 East 1<sup>st</sup> Street  
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1<sup>st</sup> Street at 4:30 p.m.

**Board Members Present:**

Sean Banda – Chair  
Tracy Roedel – Vice Chair  
Brian Sandstrom  
Randy Carter  
Taylor Candland  
J. Seth Placko  
Nicole Thompson

**Board Members Absent:**

None

**Staff Present:**

John Wesley  
Andrew Spurgin  
Tom Ellsworth  
Wahid Alam  
Kim Steadman  
Lesley Davis  
Charlotte Bridges  
Rebecca Gorton

**Others Present:**

Don Henning  
Anthony Borba  
Justin Gregonis  
Shaine Alleman  
David Brown  
David Tait  
George Lance  
Michael Liviertos  
Jose Elias Martinez

A. **Call to Order**

Chair Banda called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

B. **Consider the Minutes from the September 13, 2016 meeting**

On a motion by Vice Chair Roedel and seconded by Boardmember Carter, the Board unanimously approved the September 13, 2016 minutes.

(Vote: 7-0)

C. **Consider the Minutes from the October 11, 2016 meeting**

On a motion by Vice Chair Roedel and seconded by Boardmember Carter, the Board unanimously approved the October 11, 2016 minutes.

(Vote: 7-0)

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

D. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review cases:

**Item D.1. DR16-025                      Light Rail Station, TPSS & Retention Basin**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            1235 E. Main Street  
**REQUEST:**                        Review for the future Light Rail Station  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            4  
**OWNER:**                            Jay Yenerich, Valley Metro  
**APPLICANT:**                    Andrew Haines, Jacobs Engineering  
**ARCHITECT:**                    Dan Marinaro, Wendell Companies  
**STAFF PLANNER:**                Wahid Alam, AICP

**MOTION:** It was moved by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Vice Chair Roedel that DR16-025 be approved with the following conditions:

1. Compliance with the development as described in the Design Review Board staff report and as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, floor plans and exterior elevations.
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services, Engineering, Transportation, and Solid Waste Departments.
4. All backflow preventers 2” or larger shall be screened with landscape material located within a 6’ radius of the backflow preventer. All backflow preventers less than 2” shall be placed in a wire mesh basket *and painted green.* *(The City of Mesa has requested the change to green, to discourage theft.)*
5. Fire risers, building downspouts and roof access ladders shall be located within the building.
6. Roof and ground mounted mechanical equipment shall be fully screened per Section 11-30-9 of current Mesa Zoning Code.

**VOTE:** (6-0; Boardmember Placko, recused)

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item D.2. DR16-026                      Light Rail Station, TPSS & Park and Ride**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 1859 E. Main Street  
**REQUEST:** Review for the future Light Rail Station  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 4  
**OWNER:** Jay Yenerich, Valley Metro  
**APPLICANT:** Andrew Haines, Jacobs Engineering  
**ARCHITECT:** Dan Marinaro, Wendell Companies  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Wahid Alam, AICP

**MOTION:** It was moved by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Vice Chair Roedel that DR16-026 be approved with the following conditions:

1. Compliance with the development as described in the Design Review Board staff report and as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, floor plans and exterior elevations.
2. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
3. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services, Engineering, Transportation, and Solid Waste Departments.
4. All backflow preventers 2" or larger shall be screened with landscape material located within a 6' radius of the backflow preventer. All backflow preventers less than 2" shall be placed in a wire mesh basket *and painted green. (The City of Mesa has requested the change to green, to discourage theft.)*
5. Fire risers, building downspouts and roof access ladders shall be located within the building.
6. Roof and ground mounted mechanical equipment shall be fully screened per Section 11-30-9 of current Mesa Zoning Code.

**VOTE:** (6-0; Boardmember Placko, recused)

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

E. Other Business:

**Item E.1.** Review and provide staff feedback on a request through Administrative Review for elevation changes at 106, 112 and 118 E. McKellips Road (PLN2016-00699)

**Discussion:** Staff member Charlotte Bridges requested feedback on an Administrative Review request for elevations changes at 106, 112 and 118 E. McKellips Road. Planning Director, John Wesley, stated that the current design element is unique and is not seen anywhere else in the City.

Boardmember Thompson

- Inquired about a landscape plan and the applicant replied they will be providing one
- Feels the second version presented is refreshing
- Likes the new colors

Boardmember Carter

- Inquired about thickness of building parapets.
- Feels the sense of hierarchy on the feature pieces is in question
- Feels the straight parapet looks odd
- Feels the design is visually inconsistent
- Feels the architecture needs to be improved
- Feels the design is almost there just needs more work on proportions in architecture
- Feels it needs to be more creative

Chair Banda

- Feels the design needs higher standard similar to the Uhaul
- Suggested enhancing lighting, not standard wall packs

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

F. Adjournment

On a motion by Boardmember Thompson and seconded by Boardmember Candland, the Meeting was adjourned at 4:54 pm.

(Vote: 7-0)

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:55 pm.

G. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.1. DR16-020**

**Avilla Lehi**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 3400 – 3600 block of East Thomas Road  
**REQUEST:** Review of a multi-residence  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 1  
**OWNER:** Rodney and Janelle Engel  
**APPLICANT:** Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA  
**ARCHITECT:** Dave Soltysik, Terrascope Consulting  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Kim Steadman

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Requested clarification on parking
- Inquired what provisions are being made for maintenance of the amenity facilities
- Inquired about neighborhood participation
- Inquired what size trees will be planted at the gates. Stated the landscaping at the Chandler site does not read well
- Suggested planting landscape to grow quickly

Boardmember Carter

- Stated the floor plan does not reflect the stone features at entrances

Applicant Brennan Ray acknowledged the floor plans were not updated to the elevation changes.

Boardmember Placko

- Inquired if the citrus was being retained. Applicant replied the existing citrus was dying and new plantings will be installed.

Chair Banda

- Feels the rooflines are inconsistent
- Feels there is no overhang
- Wants to know depths of entrance portals
- Stated staff needs to look to ensure depth
- Likes diversity of door types
- Suggested addition of diversity to lighting

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.2. DR16-029**

**N. Power Road (Human Bean)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** SEC E. Main Street and N. Power Road  
**REQUEST:** Review for future restaurant with a drive-thru  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 5  
**OWNER:** Richard Riordan, Phoenix Dobson, LLC  
**APPLICANT:** George G. Lance, L2 Architect  
**ARCHITECT:** George G. Lance, L2 Architect  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Kim Steadman

Boardmember Thompson

- Feels the signage helps the development
- Feels the dark color will fade with Phoenix summers and may need to rethink the color choice. Applicant responded that this is the first store in the area which will show how the color holds up
- Inquired if metal panel been considered instead of the stucco

Chair Banda

- Feels the solid canopy works well
- Suggested use of metal panel on end caps

Boardmember Placko

- Feels the design does not match anything in the area
- Feels the black brush acacia not right selection to be on Power Road
- Feels the Autumn Sage is not appropriate

Boardmember Carter

- Stated he has no objection if the dark stucco is changed to a metal panel in the future

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.3. DR16-031                      1131 – 1149 E. University Drive**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            1131 – 1149 E. University  
**REQUEST:**                        Review for development of new multi-residential  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            4  
**OWNER:**                            Eleven Thirty-One East, LP  
**APPLICANT:**                     Justin Francis, G.A. Hann  
**ARCHITECT:**                     CCBG Architects, Inc.  
**STAFF PLANNER:**                Kim Steadman

**Discussion:** Staff planner Kim Steadman presented the design for a new multi-residential development.

**Boardmember Carter**

- Feels the updated design looks less than like a jail than the previous design
- Feels it needs to be more family like and playful, less institutional looking
- Feels the awnings make no sense and there are other ways to do this
- Stated it needs to be redone
- Feels there is a need for redevelopment that will help the neighborhood to pull together
- Feels the residents need someplace happy to go to

**Boardmember Sandstrom**

- Feels that anything that is redeveloping should bring a new modern feel to it and this does not bring any happiness to the site.
- Suggested it be brought back [to the Board]
- Feels it needs more visual interest on all sides of the buildings
- Suggested it needs a better understanding of the outdoor space
- Suggested more lighting and materiality
- Feels the elevation needs more push and play
- Suggested the use of planter boxes and allow the building to get closer to the street if they want to get street feel like Tempe
- Suggested a courtyard inside for the residents

**Vice Chair Roedel**

- Feels the elevations do not reflect the step down to the upper story section
- Stated she is not crazy about parapet type thing on the top
- Feels the need to see patios and balconies



**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

Boardmember Thompson

- Feels it has the look of a Microtel

Boardmember Carter

- Suggested that it needs to come back [to the Board]
- Feels it is too flat

Chair Banda

- Suggested the need to understand AC components
- Feels the plans do not show how the street is integrated on site plan and landscape plan
- Suggested the need for covered bike parking

Boardmember Placko

- Feels if the building comes closer to the street then needs additional trees
- Suggested that Eucalyptus is appreciated along the east
- Suggested it needs more definition

The Board requested that the project be back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.4. DR16-034                      3700 block of S. Power Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            3700 block of S. Power Road  
**REQUEST:**                        Review for a future swim school with outdoor pool  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            6  
**OWNER:**                            David Tait, EVO Swim School  
**APPLICANT:**                    David Tait, EVO Swim School  
**ARCHITECT:**                    Vertical Design Studios  
**STAFF PLANNER:**              Lesley Davis

**Discussion:** Staff member Lesley Davis presented the Board with an overview of the updated project.

Chair Banda

- Likes added windows on west elevation

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Likes addition of masonry pop out and the change in materiality

Boardmember Carter

- Likes the new design

Vice Chair Roedel

- Agrees that the new design works well

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.5. DR16-035                      1300 block of E. McKellips Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            1300 block of E. McKellips Road  
**REQUEST:**                        Review for a future restaurant with a drive-thru  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            1  
**OWNER:**                            Richard S. Dobrusin  
**APPLICANT:**                    Bill Cantieri, Piazza RCC  
**ARCHITECT:**                    Vertical Design Studios  
**STAFF PLANNER:**                Wahid Alam

**Discussion:** Staff member Wahid Alam presented the Board with an overview of the project. Sake Reindersma, architect, reviewed the changes made from the previous submittal.

Boardmember Banda

- Likes the internalized lighting and underneath canopy detail that other locations have done

Boardmember Thompson

- Needs to do something with the large area under canopy

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Suggested that the storefront just dies into the ceilings and needs to be changed out, with brick or something similar

There was discussion on outdoor seating. The Board consensus is that they like the use of wood under the canopy.

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.6. DR16-037                      10748 E. Guadalupe Road (Bank of America)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            10748 E. Guadalupe Road  
**REQUEST:**                        Review for future development of bank branch  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            6  
**OWNER:**                            G. Brown Investments 1, LLC  
**APPLICANT:**                    Don Henning  
**ARCHITECT:**                    Luis Cruz Martinez  
**STAFF PLANNER:**               Mia Lozano

**Discussion:** Staff member Mia Lozano presented the Board with an overview of the project.

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Feels the drive thru looks foreign from the rest of the building
- Feels the rest of the building ties in to the center

Boardmember Thompson

- Suggested the use of different material at drive thru to dress up so it looks like part of the building

Chair Banda

- Suggested adding column details

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.7. DR16-041                      2200 – 2300 Blocks of E. Jacinto Road (Jacinto Place)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 2200 – 2300 Blocks of E. Jacinto Road  
**REQUEST:** Review of a multi-residence development  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 3  
**OWNER:** Genica Arizona, LLC  
**APPLICANT:** Nextgen Apartments  
**ARCHITECT:** Eric Miller  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Kim Steadman

**Discussion:** Andrew Spurgin reminded the Board this is a change from the previous project for this site that was presented in June.

David Brown, 1845 S. Rose Circle, spoke in support as an owner of the Ranch West Neighborhood. He has worked with the Nextgen group about the site changes and feels it is a good project. Mr. Brown made a request for a marked pedestrian cross walk across Jacinto to the basin.

Staff member Kim Steadman reviewed the new project and stated there is a new site plan under consideration for approval.

**Boardmember Sandstrom**

- Likes this project better than the previous one
- Feels the massing is awkward
- Likes the privacy of this project
- Suggested using different colors
- Feels it needs more materiality
- Suggested integration of burnished CMU, perhaps exposed aggregate CMU, metal panels
- Suggested addition of some reveals on the stucco
- Feels the landscape and pool is the most exciting thing.

**Boardmember Thompson**

- Feels the colors are shades of depression
- Likes the tile stone

**Chair Banda**

- Likes the previous homey architecture and detail
- Liked the smaller structures along Jacinto adjacent to neighborhood in the previous design
- Feels the project is more integrated
- Inquired about lighting
- Indicated that the project needs to come back to the Board

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

Boardmember Placko

- Inquired about signage and location of the monument
- Inquired about the materials

The Board requested that the project be back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

**Item G.8. DR16-042                      7800 block of E. Baseline Road (Villa Rialto, Phase II)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:**            7800 block of E. Baseline Road  
**REQUEST:**                        Review of a multi-residence development  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:**            6  
**OWNER:**                            Light in the Desert Southern Baptist Church  
**APPLICANT:**                     Reese Anderson, Pew & Lake, PLC  
**ARCHITECT:**                      Edmir Dzudza  
**STAFF PLANNER:**                Andrew Spurgin

Discussion: Andrew Spurgin presented the case to the Board

Boardmember Placko

- Feels the landscape plan needs better transition from the Church property's Palo Verdes to the proposed Cissos

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
November 8, 2016**

<b>Item G.9. DR16-043</b>	<b>6400 block of E. Test Drive, Lot G</b>
<b>LOCATION/ADDRESS:</b>	6400 block of E. Test Drive, Lot G
<b>REQUEST:</b>	Review for development of auto sales offices
<b>COUNCIL DISTRICT:</b>	6
<b>OWNER:</b>	FCA Realty, LLC
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Paul Gilbert, Beus Gilbert, PLLC
<b>ARCHITECT:</b>	Matt Dohrmann, Dohrmann Architects, Inc.
<b>STAFF PLANNER:</b>	Lesley Davis

Discussion: Applicant, Marc Dohrman, reviewed the project and stated that the parking lot lighting will be different than at the dealership.

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested retaining trees along Test Drive
- Feels the need for different tree species for parking lot islands without thorns

Chair Banda

- Likes that lighting will not be same as dealership lighting

Boardmember Thompson

- Requested clarification on the split face block

Staff will work with applicant to finalize design.